# MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE HAWAIʻI CLIMATE CHANGE MITIGATION AND ADAPTATION COMMISSION

DATE: THURSDAY, JUNE 22, 2023

TIME: 2:00 PM

PLACE: 1151 PUNCHBOWL STREET, CONFERENCE ROOM 132 HONOLULU, HI 96813, AND VIDEO CONFERENCE

PUBLIC VIEWING LINK: [https://www.youtube.com/@climatecoordinator2356](https://www.youtube.com/%40climatecoordinator2356)

Attendees:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Dawn Chang, DLNR, Co-ChairMary Alice Evans, OPSD, Co-ChairSen. Mike Gabbard Rep. Nicole LowenSharon Hurd, Board of AgricultureScott Glenn, Governor’s OfficeMark Glick, DBEDT DesigneeKatie L. Ducatt, DHHL DesigneeCurt Otaguro, DOE | Diana Felton, DOH DesigneeNoele Cole, C&CH DPP DesigneeJoshua Cooper, Maui County DPP DesigneeZendo Kern, Hawai’i Planning DepartmentMelissa Miranda-Johnson, DOT DesigneeLeah Laramee, CCMAC Staff Jo Dunne, CCMAC StaffKiera Williams, CCMAC Staff  |

Additional attendees: Meg Turner (Sen Gabbards Office), Nancy McPherson (DHHL), Ben Sullivan (C&CH), Jesus Basuel (CCMAC), Kara Neal (CCMAC), Nicole Cole (DPP), Monique Schafer (HSEO), Dante Hirata-Epstein (CCMAC), Amy Wirts, Cindy Young, Kiana Otsuka (HSEO), Stephen Walls (HSEO), Trinity Gilliam (CCMAC), Michael Cain (DLNR), Ketty Loeb (UH Mānoa)

The meeting took place in a hybrid format. It was hosted in person at 1151 Punchbowl Street and on Zoom and live cast on the Commission's YouTube for public viewing. All materials are posted on the Commission’s website: .https://climate.hawaii.gov/hi-commission/.

1. **Welcome, roll call, and announcements.** The public viewing link opened 37 minutes before the meeting began. Co-Chair Evans began the meeting at approximately 2:02PM when all but one for a quorum was reached. It was agreed to delay voting on the action item until quorum was reached.
	1. Co-Chair Evans gave roll call.
	2. Co-Chair Evans introduced Scott Glenn, former Co-Chair, who is now in a new role with the Governor’s Office as a policy advisor/climate and housing coordinator.
	3. Ketty Lobe, UH institute for sustainability and resilience, announced a survey on sea level rise that is being released 06/23 about public perception on climate change. It is especially geared towards elected representatives. She plans to share the survey with the commission.
	4. Co-Chair Chang introduced her staff in attendance, including Michael Cain (OCCL) on the front lines of sea level rise and coastlines. Amy Wirts (Sea Grant), Cindy Young DLNR Attorney generals office, and Leah Laramee (CCMAC). Laramee acknowledged the VISTA cohort members who were present as well.
	5. Since quorum had still not yet been reached, it was determined to postpone item II (02/16/23 meeting minutes) and move onto item III (legislative updates).
2. **Presentation on 2023 Legislative Update** (non-action item) Co-Chair Evans, Sen. Gabbard, Sen. Lowen (9:53)
3. Co-Chair Evans introduced Sen. Gabbard over Zoom, who gave a presentation overviewing this year’s legislative session.
	1. 254 bills were referred to the Senate Committee of Agriculture and the Environment this year with an agriculture and environmental focus.
	2. 3 of these bills went to conference committee. Those on the governor’s desk are SB966 (solid waste), SB1024 (zero-emissions transportation), and SB1417 (sea level rise). Significant bills that died are HB197 (refrigerant management), HB837 (green infrastructure), HB1396 (cesspool conversion), SB445 (pollution abetment), and SB504 (PFAS).
	3. The “cattle call” towards the end of the session took everyone by surprise, with all committees being called into a room to vote at once. Sen Gabbard emphasized the importance of continuing to have perseverance and try to pass bills in the future, even when events like this happen.
	4. Sen Gabbard continued with a more detailed overview of bills that passed and their potential good effects. 4 passed and 59 failed, including priority bills. He went over the top 10 that didn’t pass but had money allocated from the budget, and the top 10 that did not get a budget but that he will attempt to put through next year. He expressed especial disappointment about the bills for the green amendment, green fee, and PFAS not passing.
	5. Sen. Gabbard ended his presentation abruptly due to another existing commitment, and gave contacts to reach out to with questions.
4. Co-Chair Evans paused the legislative updates to introduce Morris Atta, Climate Resiliency Manager with DOT, who had just arrived. Laramee also acknowledged Rep. Lowen and Commissioner Otaguro (DOE) who had arrived. Since quorum was reached, Co-Chair Evans returned to item II.
5. **February 16, 2023 meeting minutes** (Action item.) Co-Chair Evans (30:42)

# Co-Chair Evans requested that any comments or additions to the commission meeting minutes for February 16th, 2023, be brought forth. No comments were given.

# Co-Chair Evans called for motion to approve the meeting minutes for February 16th, 2023. Motion by Co-Chair Chang, Second by Commissioner Kern. Motion passed unanimously.

1. **Continuation of Presentation on 2023 Legislative Update** (non-action item) Co-Chair Evans, Sen. Gabbard, Sen. Lowen (32:45)
2. Sen. Lowen resumed the legislative updates presentation with an overview of the bills that applied to her sector:
	1. Energy-related bills that passed were HB 192 (mercury lamp phase-out) and SB 691 (energy and water appliance efficiency standards). A bill that failed was HB 193 (extension of the EEPS to 2045, currently end in 2030).
	2. Transportation-related bills that passed were HB600 (safe routes to school), SB968 (secure bicycle storage pilot), and SB1024 (interisland transit). Bills that failed were HB346 (workplace EV charging in state facilities), HB1252 (incentives for EV charging in state facilities), HB198 (rebates for EV purchases), and HB937 (rental fleet transition).
	3. Lowen gave an update on positive state budget allocations, including increased funding for the EVCS rebate program, $1 million in carbon smart land management funds, $100 in HGIA funding (including for rooftop solar), Hydrogen Hub funding, CZM funding, Waikiki resilience funding, and natural resources funding.
	4. Lowen gave an update on resolution successes: HCR192, HCR17, and SCR82. HR125 and HR198 did not pass, but will be brought forward again next year.
3. Co-Chair Evans asked for any questions or comments on the legislative updates, and none were given.
4. General discussion ensued on possible bills for next year. Co-chair Chang addressed DLNR funding, which this year was awarded funds for forestry and state parks, but was cut $82 million in general funding, which is significant. Co-Chair Chang expressed gratitude toward Lowen for her legislative support.
5. Commissioner Hurd reported no major updates, but expressed that her department is underfunded as a whole.
6. Co-Chair Evans opened the discussion to public comment.
	1. Ben Sullivan thanked Lowen for her work on bill 1252 and emphasized that he would continue to support it because of the principles of equity and targeted universalism. Lowen thanked him.
	2. Co-chair asked Sullivan to elaborate on targeted universalism. Sullivan explained that it means equal access to resources and gave examples of tax credits that benefit those with more resources (solar) instead of populations who need the most support, which needs to be the first priority.
	3. Commissioner Glick agreed with the sentiment that some departmental funding is better than none and gave an update on HSEO’s $20 million grant request that would fund energy resources and storage programs for low- and moderate-income customers.
	4. Co-Chair Evans asked for any further comments, and none were given.
7. **Commission Member Updates** (non-action item) (48:02)
8. Commissioner Felton shared about the topic of climate change and health effects, and efforts to uplift that conversation since it hasn’t been prioritized historically.
	1. There has been approval for a climate and health position.
		1. A temporary position that has already started
	2. Established a Statewide Climate and Health Hui
	3. Conducting a climate and health vulnerability assessment using national framework.
	4. There will be a study this summer on temperature and heat-related illnesses. Even though Hawai’i does not get as hot as other locations, heat, humidity, and lack of trade winds can impact those living without proper ventilation conditions or AC. The study will assess the need for a community cooling center or a cooling officer.
	5. DOH has been working with Climate Commission on a new Statewide greenhouse gas assessment.
		1. Ben Sullivan asked about the timeline for the greenhouse gas report. It will be complete in March of 2024.
9. Commissioner Hurd shared climate and agriculture updates.
	1. Legislative bill on the effects of heat stress on animals, which did not pass.
	2. DOA is also pursuing an affordable clean energy grant, which would be loaned through energy companies to entities such as farms, food hubs, and other state entities.
10. Commissioner Ducatt shared DHHL’s progress on sustainability issues.
	1. Applying for a shoreline management plans for homesteads near coastlines.
	2. DHHL has received $500,000 in appropriations to investigate geothermal energy sources on Big Island.
11. Commissioner Cole expressed excitement to work with CCMAC, as she had been appointed two days ago.
	1. One Water Panel developed guiding documents for CIP projects and provide a blueprint for moving forward.
	2. Department of Planning and Permitting (DPP) has received $400,000 additional funding for adaptation in the Waikiki area through a City one water lens.
	3. There are also new measures to work on reducing building energy costs, as well as other green initiatives.
	4. Ben Sullivan deferred CSSR’s update until a later agenda item, but thanked everyone for their work, especially DPP for their work with rooftop solar.
12. Commissioner Miranda-Johnson had no present updates for DOT.
13. Commissioner Kern shared that the County of Hawaii is close to finishing its county Climate Action Plan. The draft is complete and has gone through public review, and next month it will go to the county council for review and resolution.
14. Commissioner Glick introduced DBED’s new deputy, Steven Walls, who has previously served on the Natural Resources Defense Council. Walls introduced himself and expressed excitement to be here.
15. Commissioner Cooper shared Maui County’s Updates
	1. The Office of Sustainability has put up their climate action plan for public comment for one month.
	2. The Malama Maui Million native tree project is active between now and 2026.
	3. Launched a fellows program which will focus on UN global goals, held a voluntary local review with Rapa Nui and Fiji do to reviews from a pacific island perspective on indigenous issues for their 2030 agenda, and started an Hawaii Green Growth hub.
16. Co-chair Evans shared updates from the Office of Planning and Sustainable Development.
	1. working on framework for managed retreat policies, which will focus on appropriateness and factors for policy makers to consider.
	2. They are also beginning phase 2 of a study on sea level rise in Waikiki, and phase 2 of another study on sea level rise in state facilities that will analyze risk assessment tools being used around the country to prioritize risk management for flooding and groundwater.
	3. Funding is available for county CZM programs
17. Co-chair Chang shared the Department of Land and Natural Resources’ (DLNR) update.
	1. Commission on Water Resource Management is announcing a drought season, so departments should be prepared to participate in water conservation management.
	2. Awarded a coral mitigation measure to respond to sea level rise, which DLNR is using to create artificial reefs to mitigate wave action on near shores. Co-Chair Chang reminded everyone that climate change is inevitable and here, and we need to quantify the impact of it on nearshore waters, forest reserves, and water quality. Having good data on the future impacts of climate change will help to better inform decisions.
	3. Cain added that the effects of sea level rise on highways is an urgent issue right now, and Maui is ahead of O’ahu in this matter. We will likely have to choose between highway and beach in the future. Chang agreed that current measure that are being taken will help us to address this.
	4. Commissioner Hurd Ag joked that Kamehameha Highway should be renamed “Seaplane Seaway”.
18. **Presentation on Climate Pollution Reduction Application** (non-action item) Leah Laramee (CCMAC), Monique Schaffer (HSEO), Ben Sullivan (C&CH) (1:31:56)
19. Laramee gave a short recap of last meeting’s motion to apply for CPRG funds. She shared that a draft of the workplan was submitted April 28th thanks to a draft team and MIT grad students who helped, as well as a review team that included some Climate Commission members. 3 million in funding was requested, including funding for 5 new positions, and we are expecting an award letter shortly.
	1. Leah clarified that the Priority Climate Action Plan and the Comprehensive Climate Action Plan will work in tandem yet have slightly different focuses. The Priority Climate Action Plan will be the key to accessing a 4.6 billion pot of money for implementation, and the Comprehensive Climate Action plan will be more detailed and community-based. Both will focus on mitigation.
	2. Leah gave an overview of the positions that will be opening up with the Climate Commission, and plans for community outreach. The website page for outreach has been launched, and it outlines timeline and mitigation strategies. Technical working groups are being formed, which will outline the details for decarbonization actions, barriers, workforce building, and funding. Focus areas will be transportation, electricity, waste, AFOLU (agroforestry/wetlands/urban forestry farming/ranching/food systems), and IPPU (industrial processes and product use). Equity and climate justice will be central to these efforts as well, along with determining strategies that address both mitigation and adaptation.
	3. The results of the focus groups and the CPRG review will go to the Climate Commission for review. We are hiring a position to coordinate these efforts as well.
	4. The State Decarbonization Strategy is also in progress, as is the State PCAP and the C&CH PCAP. We will be working closely with them to coordinate efforts.
20. Monique Schafer (HSEO) gave an overview of the state decarbonization strategy. It looks at all sectors and will consider all options to reach net negative emissions through policy, regulatory action, and project-specific actions. The decarbonization strategy will also be the launching point for the PCAP, and include emissions projections, as well as equity for disadvantaged and ALICE communities. HSEO is contracting with E3 to create the plan and will conduct targeted community outreach.
21. Ben Sullivan encouraged everyone to reflect on the historical moment they are in. He expressed amazement that funding is now readily available for climate action and implementation, since it had to be fought hard for historically. He expressed gratitude towards Leah for her efforts in getting everyone together for these efforts. He also expressed the importance of getting the public together, since climate action should not just be a government action. Public support will be gathered through projects that directly benefit communities and make their lives better. Collaboration and equity will both be important. He also spoke about building efficiency, which will help a lot in reducing emissions, including starting a program for retrofits for affordable housing which would include practical things like new paint, insulation, and things to adapt to heat. Sullivan thanked everyone for their collaboration.
22. **Presentation on Environmental Justice Work** (non-action item) Co-Chair Evans, Parker Kushima (HSEO) (1:55:45)
23. Laramee introduced Parker Kushima (HSEO). He gave some background on the importance of identifying disadvantaged communities who will be affected by climate change, and the programs and acts covered by the Justice 40 initiative.
	1. Kushima gave an overviewed of the SCOVI report and its findings, including the need for the creation of a centralized data hub, editing existing data to use the lowest available spatial scale, expanding capacity and expertise to operationalize SVI in decision making, and addressing data gaps. He presented information on existing mapping tools, and stressed the importance of including community mana’o alongside them.
	2. Kushima overviewed current SVI work that is being done, including the Energy Equity Hui, the Costal Zone Management Program, the Broadband Hui, efforts through Oahu MPO/City & County, and ongoing cross-sectional meetings.
	3. Kushima gave background on the CJEST tool and how its representation of Hawai’i isn’t accurate. Issues include the binary definition of “disadvantaged”, missing data, the use of census tract data rather than locally relevant boundaries, and low-income eligibility set at the 200% poverty level. He touched on bill HB441/SB657 for a data portal not passing, and that CCMAC will be hiring a data specialist for this.
	4. Next steps/priorities will include coordination between organizations to share data and identify gaps, defining deliverables, building on the SCOVI report, hiring the data specialist, connecting with CEQ to update missing data, and identifying funding to address all of this.
	5. Commissioner Felton asked him about FEMA’s index, and if he had considered isolation as a factor to identify vulnerability. Parker agreed to connect with her on this further and to look into it.
24. **Coordinator’s Update** (non-action item)Leah Laramee (CCMAC Coordinator) (2:13:45)
25. Laramee spoke about the Climate Smart Assistance Program for agriculture, and the specialist position that is being hired for it.
26. Jo Dunne presented on the Climate Commission’s recent Community Climate Fairs that were held on O’ahu and Big Island. They were a successful effort to provide community members with information and resources about climate change, and for local organizations to network.
27. Kiana Otsuka presented on O’ahu mobility hubs, which are managed by the Climate Commission and funded by O’ahu MPO. A study has begun to identify potential sites for mobility hubs. Staff and volunteers are currently beginning the process of taking a parking inventory by counting state parking spots. Otsuka asked everyone to contact her if they are interested in participating.
28. Amy Wirts gave an update on the Punalu’u beach restoration project, including the recent assessment, ongoing surveys, and community outreach. The goal is exploring nature-based solutions to protect both beach and infrastructure, as well as to improve community access.
	1. Co-chair Chang asked for an update on Tang, a community member who recently received citations for illegal shoreline hardening. Amy said his house is still there, although it was moved far back on the property. There is still debris near the property, which is unfortunate since the east side of the park might be the best candidate for restoration.
	2. Laramee offered to share Wirts’s contact information for any other questions about this project
29. Laramee shared the schedule for the remainder of Climate Commission meetings this year.

 **Meeting adjourned at 4:38PM (YouTube time stamp at 2:34:02)**